Use this side for a paper that TAKES A STAND ON AN ISSUE

Writer’s Name: ________________________________

Reviewer’s Name: ________________________________

What is the position/stand/thesis? Is it clearly stated? Is it effectively qualified and refined?

Has the writer shown how the stand affects the writer and others?

Are the reasoning and support sound and complete? Any fallacies?

What KINDS of support does the writer give? What other kinds might be useful?

Does the essay show awareness of questions, concerns, and other positions (concessions)?

Is the tone confident and sincere, not bullying, cocky, or apologetic?
Use this side for a paper that PROPOSES A SOLUTION to AN EXISTING PROBLEM

Writer’s Name: ________________________________

Reviewer’s Name: ______________________________

Problem:

Proposed solution:

Is the problem real, serious, and fairly complex? Is it really worth finding a solution for?

Does the solution fit the problem?

Is the proposed solution precise, well reasoned, realistic, and complete?

Does the solution acknowledge and address all objections?

Does the voice fit the problem and treat the opposition tactfully?

Is the opening engaging? Is the conclusion thoughtful, forceful, and clear?